



RCSI



EQUIVALENT STANDARDS ROUTE (ESR) GUIDELINES

Standardised Selection Process for Specialty Training in TRAUMA AND ORTHOPAEDIC SURGERY

July 2022 Intake

*Please note that the Guide to the Marking System for Specialty Training Intake July 2022 is subject to change.
Notification of changes will be published as early as possible

A CORE/BASIC SURGICAL TRAINING RECORD**0**

In order to be eligible all candidates must have completed Core Surgical Training (CST) or recognised equivalent and have passed the MRCS examination

B POST CORE/BASIC SURGICAL TRAINING RECORD**45****Workplace Performance:**

- 6 months full time orthopaedic registrar in a recognised training unit.
(7 marks per rotation) (21 max)
- TAR (Trainee assessment Report) - 5 marks per 6 month Rotation
(5x3 different trainers for each report required) (15 max)
- Signed Logbook per 6 month Rotation
(3x3 rotations) (9 max)

C ACADEMIC DEVELOPMENT AND PERFORMANCE**55**

1.	Higher Degree by Thesis		20 (max)
	• PhD	15	
	• MD	12	
	• MCh	10	

Marks are cumulative, relevant higher degrees should be in the field of orthopaedics. Consideration will be given to other masters and relevant higher degrees and diplomas to the specialty. Marking for these will be at the discretion of the shortlisting committee.

2. Publications (please read notes below on this section)**15 (max)**

- 1st name orthopaedic journal/paper impact factor x 2
- 2nd name orthopaedic journal/paper impact factor x 1
- Case report : orthopaedic report only – 1st name only
x (0.5) or a mark of 0.25 (whichever is higher) impact factor(if available)
- Non specialty journal publication – 1st name only impact factor x 1

3.	Presentations at Scientific/ Clinical Meetings		10 (max)
	• International/Cappagh Prize(1st name only)	2	(2 each, 5 max)
	• National (1st name only)	1	
4.	Courses		7.5 (max)
	• Relevant Orthopaedic Courses 0.5 per day, at shortlisting committee's discretion.		
5.	Awards, Distinctions, Prizes		2.5 (max)

TOTAL PRE INTERVIEW SCORE**100 MAX****THIS SCORE IS THEN CONVERTED TO A MARK OUT OF 60****D. INTERVIEW****40**

Station 1: Quality and safety in surgical healthcare
 Station 2: Commitment to academic advancement and lifelong learning
 Station 3: Knowledge of current issues relevant to surgical practice
 Station 4: Decision making in surgery
 Station 5: Professionalism and probity in surgical practice

TOTALS FOR INTERVIEW = MAX 40, ADDED TO PRE INTERVIEW SCORE YIELDS MAX 100 FINAL SCORE WILL BE OUT OF 100.

INTRODUCTION

The selection process for Specialty Training has three components:

1. Post Core/Basic Specialty Training record
2. Academic Development and Performance
3. Interview

To be eligible for Higher Surgical Training all candidates must have successfully passed the both parts of the MRCS at time of application.

The training of a surgeon is a lengthy and expensive process and it is very important that those who are most suited to a surgical career become our future surgeons. The purpose of the selection process for surgical training is to identify and select those applicants who are most likely to become the best consultant Orthopaedic surgeons of the future. The process should also identify and select out those who are likely to be unsuccessful or problematic as future orthopaedic surgeons and discourage them from pursuing a career pathway in same.

The initial phase of selection for surgical training in Ireland occurs at the point of entry to Core/Basic Surgical Training. A second and much more rigorous selection process occurs at the point of entry to Specialty Training. This selection process is based on:

- Performance (during Core/Basic Surgical Training), or demonstrated equivalent.
- Acquisition of competencies (both clinical and academic).
- General suitability for a career in surgery.

The selection process for Specialty Training in Trauma and Orthopaedic Surgery is an objective process which has been agreed by the Irish Surgical Postgraduate Training Committee and the process is based on an objective marking scheme, which is designed to be fair and equitable to all applicants. The process is also intended to be completely transparent and the selection criteria will be made available to applicants.

Applications for Specialty Training will be made on a standard application form which contains all of the information required to objectively assess applicants. Submission of separate curriculum vitae **is not required**. Documentary evidence of the various components of the educational and academic record should be submitted with the application form. **Any applicant who provides misleading or false information in an attempt to improve their score will be automatically disqualified and will not be allowed to make any future applications for Specialty Training in any of the surgical specialties.**

Ground Rules:

Applicants will not be scored on stated educational/publications/presentations/research /degrees awards and achievements unless written approved evidence is supplied with the application.

Publications: Proof would take the form of an official email or headed letter from editor or their appointed representative indicating full and final acceptance of publication from author. This DOES NOT include editorial commentary suggesting any further revisions to manuscripts prior to acceptance.

Presentations: Evidence of abstraction on headed parent journal for meeting or conference and or presentation published including authorship and principal presenter on official meeting/conference proceedings documents. Future presentations and those with dates beyond the closing date of application will not be considered for scoring.

Course attendance: Proof of participation in the course will be required. This should take the form of an official course attendance certificate, indicating dates attended as well as signature of course director/organiser on the certificate. Documents validating information supplied need to be received by the final academic information deadline to be eligible for scoring.

CORE/BASIC SURGICAL TRAINING RECORD**0**

Please note: applicants who completed an RCSI Core Surgical Training Programme (from 2013 onwards) or RCSI Basic Surgical Training Programme (2011 onwards) are only required to submit their CST/BST certificate. All details pertaining to your CST/BST programme are held by the Surgical Training Office. If we require further documentation we will contact you directly.

To enable the shortlisting committee to assess non RCSI ESR applicants their training and experience against the requirements of the RCSI Core Surgical Training (CST) in Ireland, evidence of equivalence must be submitted. This is not exhaustive and the onus is on the applicant to provide sufficient and appropriate evidence to support their ESR application. E.g. structured CV, Profile of posts held, MRCS transcript etc.

Further information may be required by the shortlisting committee. This information will be requested and candidates will be allowed a reasonable but specific time frame in which to furnish requested documentation.

POST-CORE/BASIC SURGICAL TRAINING RECORD**45 MAX**

This part of the selection process is intended to assess performance Post-Core/Basic Surgical Training. Marks allocated for Post-Core/Basic Surgical Training will be based on

1. Workplace performance:
2. Performance in the RCSI or other external education programmes.

A **minimum** of 10 must be achieved in this section in order to be shortlisted.

a. Workplace performance

Full time Clinical Registrar posts in approved orthopaedic training units.

7x3 21 mark

b. Trainee Assessment Reports (TARs):

Each applicant in Post-Core/Basic Surgical Training will be required to submit a trainer report from a Consultant Trainer for each 6 months of a clinical post in Post-Core/Basic Surgical Training. These reports give a detailed Trainer assessment of applicant performance in the domains of clinical skills, professional development, personal skills and interpersonal relationships. A different trainer must populate the TAR for each 6 months i.e. the same trainer cannot fill out more than one TAR form for each 6 months submitted.

5x3 15 marks

c. Electronic Logbook:

Each Post-Core/Basic Surgical Training applicant is expected to maintain their E-logbook and this will be assessed by the interview panel. A total of 3 may be awarded for the E-logbook during Post- Core/Basic Surgical Training.

3x3 9 marks

ACADEMIC DEVELOPMENT AND PERFORMANCE**55 MAX**

A maximum of 55 may be awarded in this section. It is theoretically possible for applicants to accumulate more than 55 based on thesis; other higher degrees/awards; publications and presentations but the maximum mark which may be awarded stands at 55.

1. Higher Degree :**20 max**

PhD 15
MD 12
MCh 10

Applicants should also indicate the academic year(s) in which they were officially registered for their higher degree in the university concerned.

The specialty will devise its own list of degrees and diplomas which are relevant to Trauma & Orthopaedics and for which marks will be awarded.

Marks are only awarded for degrees or diplomas which are awarded by universities or educational establishments recognised by the Irish Medical Council or by the Royal College of Surgeons in Ireland. Marks are not awarded for any degree which is obtained prior to commencement of undergraduate medical school. Likewise, marks are not awarded for any degree obtained as a matter of course during medical school.

Marks in this section are cumulative.

2. Publications**15 max**

- **Original peer reviewed scientific**

An applicant may submit any number of publications for consideration for scoring. However, the maximum mark of 15 in this section stands. Only publications in peer reviewed scientific journals will be considered. Marking is as indicated in previous section.

All publications for consideration **must have** a PMID number submitted with the application. If the publication is not yet on PubMed, there must be a letter of acceptance from the editor of the journal submitted with the application.

Applicants may not be rewarded twice for a presentation which is published automatically because it has been presented at a surgical meeting. No points will be awarded for abstracts or letters to the Editor.

Applicants **must furnish** the most up to date Impact factor of the journal publication. These numbers will be validated and awarded accordingly. If an impact factor is unavailable applicants are urged to comprehensively populate the spreadsheet with as much information as possible. Please fill out publications section with all publications preferably in decreasing order of importance. Please also note that there are no marks for second or subsequent author on non-orthopaedic papers.

3. Oral Presentations - International/Cappagh Prize/National Prizes

10 max

A maximum of 10 marks may be awarded for presentations at specialty specific scientific meetings.

- A mark of 2 will be awarded for a first name International/Cappagh prize presentation at each meeting (i.e. max 5 presentations).
- A mark of 1 will be awarded for a 1st name national presentations at each meeting (i.e max 10 presentations)

Marks in this section are cumulative up to a maximum 10. Marks are only awarded if the applicant has actually made the presentation at the meeting. No marks are awarded for being a co-author of a presentation. No marks are awarded for poster presentations. Marks will not be given twice for presenting the same material at more than one meeting. The shortlisting committee will decide what constitutes a recognised orthopaedic meeting or specialty specific section at both National and International level.

4. Courses

7.5 max

A mark of 0.5 will be awarded per day for relevant orthopaedic courses up to a max of 7.5. The shortlisting committee will decide what constitutes a recognised orthopaedic course.

5. Merits : Awards, Distinctions, Prizes

2.5 max

The shortlisting committee will consider and award marks appropriately for these merits.

The cut-off date for the award of marks in Section C will be 5pm, Friday 22nd January 2021.

Under **no** circumstances will marks be given after that date based on accepted thesis, publications or presentations.

The scores are combined from each section and are recalculated to mark out of 60. This is the pre-interview cumulative score and will determine progression to shortlisting.

The interview will then be marked out of 40 and this will be added to each interview candidates score to give a total out of 100 marks.

This will then be the final score and candidates will be panelled on this score.

INTERVIEW**40 OF TOTAL**

The interview is the final stage of this multi-part selection process for Specialty Training. The purpose of the interview is to assess the personal attributes and general suitability of an applicant for Higher Surgical Training and for a lifelong career in Surgery.

Interviews will be conducted by a properly constituted interview panel, according to the regulations of the Irish Surgical Postgraduate Training Committee (ISPTC). Each interview panel will be chaired by a member of the Council of RCSI, nominated by the President. The interview panel may only award marks for the interview and may not under any circumstances change marks already allocated to other sections at the shortlisting meeting. All documents relating to the selection process will remain in the possession of ISPTC/RCSI. A maximum global mark of 40 may be awarded at interview.

The interview will cover a broad range of areas related to suitability for Specialty Training. These will be grouped under five principal domains:

- Station 1:** Quality and safety in surgical healthcare
- Station 2:** Commitment to academic advancement and lifelong learning
- Station 3:** Knowledge of current issues relevant to surgical practice
- Station 4:** Decision making in surgery
- Station 5:** Professionalism and probity in surgical practice

A list of suggested questions for the various domains of the interview will be presented to the interview panel. However, these questions are simply for assistance to interviewers and are not mandatory questions. Interviewers are free to ask any questions they wish, related to the domains to be marked.

Each interviewer will mark each applicant at the end of each interview by silent voting. The mark sheets for each applicant will then be collected and the marks awarded by each interviewer will be displayed at the end of the interview process. All marks go through a QA check & any significant discrepancies in marking will be discussed by the Chair.

At the end of the entire selection process, the marks obtained in each section will be added to give the total mark in the selection process. Applicants will then be ranked and will be appointed according to their rank and the number of positions available.

In order to be eligible for appointment to ST3, a candidate must reach the minimum appointable standard in both components of the selection process:

- Component A - Pre Interview score $> / = 60$
- Component B - Interview scores $> / = 60$

The interviews will take place on an assigned date or dates and specified time/times for each candidate. The interview may take place in a specified location or embassy locations for all stakeholders. The interview may take the form of a face to face or a virtualised situation. This will remain under review in line with Government guidelines on COVID-19 & ISPTC / RCSI policy.

All information contained in this document is deemed to be a record held by RCSI for the purposes of processing your application to Specialty Training. RCSI is committed to protecting your privacy in line with applicable data protection legislation including the 'EU General Data Protection Regulation' and policies RCSI has in place under that legislation. RCSI will hold scanned copies of all applications for one year following the closing date. No originals are held or returned unless specifically requested by the applicant.

Entry Requirements:

- All applicants must hold the award of the CST (Core Surgical Training) certificate, or equivalent at the time of application.
- If CST was not completed in RCSI a mandatory attendance to HF & OSS Assessments/Courses is required.
- All applicants must be registered with the Irish Medical Council (www.medicalcouncil.ie) or any other EU medical regulatory registration body.
- Please see important information regarding allocation of training places for 2022 at <http://www.rcsi.ie/surgery/training>

Selection Process:

The Equivalent Standards Route (ESR) Process for Trauma and Orthopaedic Surgery is available to download from: <http://www.rcsi.ie/surgery/training>. All applicants are advised to familiarise themselves with this.

Completed applications to:

Leah Daly RCSI
Surgical Affairs Surgical Training Office 121 St. Stephens Green
Dublin 2 Ireland

Queries to: Leah Daly
Email: Orthopaedics@rcsi.ie
Phone: 353-1-402 2195

Note:

This application form is not for applicants who are currently on the RCSI Core Surgical Training Programme i.e. progressing directly from ST2 to ST3.

Shortlisted applicants may be asked to submit verification of other documents outlined in the application form.

All information contained in this document is deemed to be a record held by RCSI for the purposes of processing your application to Specialty Training. RCSI is committed to protecting your privacy in line with applicable data protection legislation including the 'EU General Data Protection Regulation' and policies RCSI has in place under that legislation. RCSI will hold scanned copies of all applications for one year following the closing date. No originals are held or returned unless specifically requested by the applicant.

Any attempt to provide misleading or false information to improve your score will result in automatic disqualification. No deferrals of commencement of programme in July 2022 permitted.